

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

DRAFT.

of the

42nd MEETING OF THE IMPERIAL WAR GRAVES COMMISSION

held at

THE WAR OFFICE

on

TUESDAY, 21st FEBRUARY, 1922.

PRESENT:

COLONEL W.W.CHITTY, C.M.G., Representing the Secretary of State for
India.

The Rt.Hon.THE EARL OF CRAWFORD AND BALCARRES, K.T.,
First Commissioner of Works.

LIEUT.COLONEL G.J.HOGBEN, O.B.E.,
Representing the High Commissioner for Australia.

COLONEL The Hon.SIR JAMES ALLEN, K.C.B.,
High Commissioner for New Zealand.

The Hon.SIR EDGAR WALTON, K.C.M.G.,
High Commissioner for South Africa.

SIR WILLIAM GARSTIN, G.C.M.G., G.B.E.,

RUDYARD KIPLING, Esq.

LIEUT.GENERAL SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH, K.C.B., K.C.M.G.

VICE-ADMIRAL SIR MORGAN SINGER, K.C.V.O., C.B.

H. MADDOCKS, Esq., K.C., M.P.

and

MAJOR-GENERAL SIR FABIAN WARE, K.B.E., C.B., C.M.G.,
Vice Chairman, in the Chair.

Colonel LORD ARTHUR BROWNE, K.B.E.,

Principal Assistant Secretary.

THERE WERE ALSO PRESENT:

LIEUT.COLONEL SIR FREDERIC KENYON, K.C.B.

LIEUT.COLONEL H.BLISSON, C.B.E.,

LIEUT.COLONEL F.R.DURHAM, O.B.E., M.C.

MAJOR H.F.CHETTLE, O.B.E.,

MAJOR C.K.PHILLIPS, O.B.E.

(1) The minutes of the last meeting were considered and agreed to.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN moved that :-

(2) "The members of the Commission desire to convey to Sir George Perley their earnest and sincere appreciation of the assistance which his constant attendance, his wide sympathies, and his great administrative experience have been to them in their deliberations since the Commission was formed."

The resolution was seconded by Sir James Allen and agreed unanimously.

REPORT OF 50TH AND 51ST MEETINGS OF FINANCE COMMITTEE.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said there was one question in the Report of the 51st Meeting of the Finance Committee to which he wished to draw their special attention. They had been issuing to the staff in devastated areas bedding and furniture for those cases in which furnished lodgings could not be obtained, and the Finance Committee came to the conclusion that they ought to make a charge of 6d. a week to the men to whom it was issued. He thought there might be discontent among the men on the subject and the Finance Committee were inclined to refer the question to the Commission.

SIR JAMES ALLEN said that the Finance Committee were in doubt on the matter.

COLONEL HOGBEN and other members were strongly opposed to this charge being made under the circumstances and,

SIR EDGAR WALTON moved:

(3) "That para.2. Section 13, of the 51st Meeting of the Finance Committee be not approved."

The resolution was seconded by the Earl of Crawford and agreed to.

SIR JAMES ALLEN moved:

(4) "That subject to this amendment, the Reports of the

50th and 51st Meetings of the Finance Committee
be adopted."

The resolution was seconded by Sir William
Garstin and agreed to.

REPORT OF MEETING OF
COMMITTEE ON MEMORIALS TO THE MISSING.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said the Report of this Committee was for
adoption by the Commission. The Committee had before them
tentative proposals as to the distribution of memorials to
the Missing along the Western Front. After consideration they
had introduced certain modifications, and the next step would
be to approach the French and Belgian Authorities with regard
to available sites. When they had selected the sites, further
proposals in regard to them and in regard to the designs would
be laid before the Commission. The Government of New Zealand
had not as yet come into the scheme, but had the question under
consideration. The scheme, for the time being at any rate,
referred only to the Missing of the United Kingdom.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH explained the scheme - in his opinion it
covered very well the whole of the ground and the places
selected appeared suitable. The matter had been considered
by the Cabinet Advisory Committee with the Secretary of State
in the Chair and a few amendments had been suggested, for
instance, that Albert would be more suitable than Pozieres
for the Somme Memorial. Another important suggestion had been
made that the memorials might take the form of buildings which
would be of use to the inhabitants, which had originally been
suggested, but over-ruled by General Ware three years ago.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that nothing definite could be brought
before the Commission until the matter had been explored a
good deal more. It was absolutely impossible at the present
stage to give any idea of the numbers of Missing that would
have to be commemorated or the way in which these would be
distributed. It was, of course, possible that some modifications

would have to be made in the details.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH said that as regards getting out the records he would be very glad for his Record Officers to give all the help they could, and to give any instructions to them that might be necessary.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said the other items in the Report dealt with the memorials at Gallipoli, Port Tewfik and Palestine.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH moved the adoption of the Report.

(5) The resolution was seconded by Colonel Chitty and agreed to.

CEMETERIES IN THE UNITED KINGDOM.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that the Commission had before them several designs for cemeteries in the United Kingdom, departing to a certain extent from the general principles that had been laid down.

SIR FREDERIC KENYON explained that in many cemeteries in the United Kingdom the bodies were buried 4, 5, 6 and 7 in a grave, and in each case there was no room to put up headstones to each man. The Commission were in no way responsible for the design for the military plots in the cemeteries and had merely to make the best of the conditions they found. Experience had shown that there were two methods which usually proved suitable, (1) a wall at the back of the cemetery and the names carved on the wall, and (2) where a wall was for local reasons impossible, a kerb round the plot with a sloping top on the kerb on which the names could be carved. All the designs had been made, suggested or approved by Sir Robert Lorimer, the Commission's Architect for the United Kingdom. He suggested that the Commission might authorise these designs as a general principle to work on in these very crowded cemeteries in the United Kingdom, so that the plans could be dealt with in the same way as the plans for cemeteries abroad,

on his certificate that the designs of the Commission had been adhered to.

Some discussion ensued as to the designs.

COLONEL HOGBEN said he wished to make it clear that the Australian Government desired that there should be some form of individual commemoration in the cemetery for each Australian buried there.

COLONEL DURHAM explained that in most cases Dominion soldiers were buried in single graves, usually in a plot of their own. Where it was possible, as it was in most cases, such men would have their individual headstones. In the rare cases in which it was not possible to put up an individual headstone on a Dominion grave, the grave would be marked by a grave number corresponding with the name as reported on the screen wall.

SIR WILLIAM GARSTIN moved the following resolution:-

- (6) (a) "That the Commission, having considered resolution No.15 of their 40th Meeting, approve the special designs for the following cemeteries :-

Lawnswood Cemetery, Leeds,
Lodge Hill Cemetery, Birmingham,
City of London Cemetery, Little Ilford.

- (b) That the Commission approve the designs of the following cemeteries :-

Cannock Chase Military Cemetery,
All Souls Cemetery, Kensal Green,
Welford Road Cemetery, Leicester,
Reading Cemetery,
Gloucester Cemetery,
Shorncliffe Cemetery,

and to authorise the Finance Committee to consider and accept tenders for the construction of the same without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Lord Crawford and agreed to.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN asked if the Commission wished all these individual designs brought before them or whether they were prepared to accept Sir Frederic Kenyon's suggestion.

It was eventually decided that a resolution dealing with the matter should be drafted for the next meeting of the Commission.

POSITION OF THE SWORD ON THE CROSS OF SACRIFICE.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that on this matter they had before them the recommendations of Sir Frederic Kenyon which he would read :

"The symbolism of the Sword, as representing the dedication of the soldier's life, is in direct relation to the graves which lie in the Cemetery. The normal position of the Sword should therefore be facing the graves, so that the visitor to the cemetery sees it when he is within the cemetery, and associates it with the dead who lie therein. If it faces outwards, the Cross will appear to have its back turned on the graves. It is the aspect within the cemetery, not that presented to the visitor approaching it, that should be the prime consideration."

He desired to obtain an expression of opinion from the Commission in order that the Architects might be instructed accordingly. Of course, the ideal position for the Cross was in some prominent position such as the back of the cemetery away from the road, where the Sword could be seen both from the road and from within the cemetery.

LORD CRAWFORD thought that the ordinary passer-by, as well as the person visiting the cemetery, should see an essential feature of the Cross such as the Sword, and that everybody should be able to see it before he gets to the grave though perhaps he could not see it from the grave. Everybody could see the Sword if it was facing outside, but would not always see it if it was facing inwards.

MR. RUDYARD KIPLING thought it more important that the Cross, with the Sword on it, should face those who came up to the cemetery. He thought that the living would naturally expect, when approaching the cemetery, to see the sign of the manner of

the particular sacrifice in which the men died. If the Sword only faced the dead it did not seem to him so valuable. He thought the Sword and the Cross were for the living and the Cross should dominate the cemetery and face the passer-by.

COLONEL CHITTY agreed with Mr. Kipling that the Sword was to show to the world and not only to those who were inside the cemetery.

SIR JAMES ALLEN agreed strongly with Sir Frederic Kenyon but thought that the Architect should, if possible, meet both views. When standing within a cemetery he looked for the Sword and for the words "Their Name Liveth for Evermore."

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH thought a possible solution was that there should be two Swords, one on each side of the Cross.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN thought that pressure should be put upon the Architects to put the Cross in a position further back so that the Sword should be visible both to those in the cemetery and to those approaching it.

This was agreed.

DECORATION OF BRITISH GRAVES BY BELGIAN AUTHORITIES.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said the Belgian Minister of War had written to them thanking the Commission for laying wreaths on the Belgian graves on the "Jour des Morts" and Major Ingpen had received an unofficial letter asking what day would be suitable to the Imperial War Graves Commission for the Belgian Authorities to do the same for British graves.

After some discussion

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH proposed that the 4th August should be the day suggested.

(7) The resolution was seconded by Mr. Maddocks and agreed to it being ^{realised} ~~noticed~~ that this would create a precedent for France and Belgium.

TREATMENT OF UNKNOWN GRAVES.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that this question was explained in the papers before them. There were many cemeteries containing a very large proportion of unknown graves and the question of treating them was a difficult one. Sir Frederic Kenyon summed up the question in the following words:

"In both cases there is (owing to concentration) a great preponderance of unknown burials. In Guards Cemetery there are 2,192 unknown burials, and 1,156 known; in the New Irish Farm 2,550 unknown and 1,193 known. If headstones are put over each grave, two out of every three will be to 'An Unknown British Soldier', in most cases (probably) without badge, and in all without personal inscription. If headstones are put only over the known graves, there will be over 1,100 headstones scattered irregularly over the cemetery, and all sense of order and community will be lost. If no headstones are erected at all, the relatives of the 1,100 known soldiers will be likely to complain. My own view is that the first alternative is the least unsatisfactory. I think the third alternative must be ruled out, since we have practically promised to provide individual headstones wherever it is not physically impossible. The second alternative I strongly deprecate, as it destroys the sense of disciplined order and symmetry which is the special note of our cemeteries."

MR. KIPLING said he had discussed the matter with several private soldiers lately and they had been unanimous in thinking that every unknown grave should have its individual headstone.

After some discussion this was agreed to.

DEFINITION OF A WAR GRAVE.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that this was a very difficult question which had been frequently discussed. The combined operations of the Termination of the Present War (Definition) Act 1918 and an Order in Council made in pursuance of it was to fix the end of the war on the 31st August 1921. The result was that the graves of many who had not actually seen any fighting would be treated as war graves, while other cases would occur in which the graves of men who were wounded in the war and died of these wounds after 31st August 1921 would not be treated as war graves. Among others also, the graves of British soldiers killed in the recent disturbances in Ireland would become war graves, and he thought that some of the Dominions would not agree to this although the cases were technically war graves. At a previous meeting the Commission had agreed that graves of soldiers who died whilst serving before the 10th January 1920 might be accepted as war graves without further enquiry. The 10th January 1920 was the date of the Ratification of Peace with Germany. Their staff had found such difficulties in the matter that they had been forced to adhere to the strict legal interpretation of the Charter.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH said he wished to press that the graves of men who died while forming part of the troops in military occupation under the Treaty of Peace of an ex-enemy country should be regarded as war graves. For instance, in Silesia it would not look well if the graves of the soldiers who died there after 31st August 1921 were left untended and uncared for. The position was the same with regard to the graves of men dying in garrisons where the Army of Occupation was quartered, such as Cologne. Here the position would be that graves of men dying before the 31st August would be treated by the Commission, while the graves of those dying subsequent to that date would

be neglected and no one would be responsible for their upkeep. MAJOR PHILLIPS explained that the meaning of the expressions "the present war" as used in the Charter was governed by the Termination of the Present War (Definition) Act 1918 and an Order in Council by which the period was fixed as from the 4th August 1914 to 31st August 1921 for the purposes of any provisions in any Order in Council deed or other instrument referring to the present war. In determining whether a grave was a war grave there was still another important consideration and that was that the cause of death must have been contracted on active service. For a definition of active service he had taken in default of a better that given in the Army Act. There was no other judicial or statutory definition of the words "on active service".

MR. RUDYARD KIPLING thought that they had better accept the finality given by a date fixed in accordance with the Charter.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH said he would like to press his point of view. In the example he had given, Silesia, they were there entirely as a result of the Treaty of Versailles.

SIR JAMES ALLEN, speaking for New Zealand, said his view was that there should be a restriction in the interpretation of the term "active service." In his opinion active service ought to end with the signing of the Armistice, and in regard to any deaths occurring after that date the Commission should decide what exceptions could be allowed. He thought there was a good deal in the argument that British soldiers who died while in occupation of a foreign country as a result of the Treaty of Peace should be regarded as entitled to war graves.

After some further discussion

THE VICE CHAIRMAN urged that a small Committee should be appointed with a view to arriving as soon as possible at something definite. He suggested the Adjutant General, Sir James Allen

and Mr.Maddocks to serve on the Committee.

He moved the following resolution:

- (8) "That it be referred to a Committee to consider and report as to a suitable definition of a war grave for treatment according to the principles laid down by the Commission and whether any, and if so what, amendments to the Charter may be necessary to enable the Commission to carry such definition into effect. That the Committee consist of Sir George Macdonogh, Sir James Allen, Mr.Maddocks and the Vice Chairman."

The resolution was seconded by Sir James Allen and agreed to.

HEADSTONE CONTRACTS.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he wanted authority for the Finance Committee to enter into contracts for the manufacture of more headstones.

SIR MORGAN SINGER moved the following resolution:

- (9) "That the Commission authorise proceeding with the placing of further contracts for 30,000 headstones and that the Finance Committee be authorised to consider and accept tenders for such headstones."

The resolution was seconded by Colonel Hogben and agreed to.

ALLIED AND ENEMY GRAVES IN EAST AFRICA.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he wished to report to the Commission that he had given authority for their Deputy Director of Works to bring in any enemy and allied graves in isolated places in East Africa when concentrating British graves.

The Commission agreed.

HEADSTONES TO REPLACE PROVISIONAL AND SPECIAL CROSSES.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he wished the Commission to consider the design of headstone which had been drawn out for headstones

to replace provisional crosses. He would also ask them to approve the inscription which had been suggested on the headstones to replace the special crosses, and that the next-of-kin should be asked to submit a personal inscription in the ordinary way.

MR. RUDYARD KIPLING moved the following resolution:

- ¹⁰
(1) "(a) That the Commission approve the Director of Works' proposed lay-out for a headstone to replace a provisional cross.
- (b) That the Commission approve the inscription "Known to be buried in this Cemetery" as the inscription to be engraved on headstones to replace "special" crosses.
- (c) That the next-of-kin be asked to submit a personal inscription for inclusion on the headstones replacing "special" crosses.
- (d) That where no inscription is supplied by the relatives the words "Their glory shall not be blotted out" be engraved at the expense of the Commission.

The resolution was seconded by Sir George Macdonogh and agreed to.

GENOA CEMETERY.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he would ask the Commission to give authority to the Finance Committee to accept tenders for the headstones in Genoa Cemetery.

MR. MADDOCKS moved the following resolution:

- ¹¹
(1) "That the Commission hereby authorise the Finance Committee to consider and accept tenders for the transport and erection of headstones in Genoa Cemetery without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Admiral Sir Morgan Singer and agreed to.

CROSS OF SACRIFICE FOR GIBRALTAR.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said the Commission would remember they had approved the proposal of the Gibraltar Agency that the Cross of Sacrifice should be erected outside the cemetery as there was no room inside, and the site was a suitable one.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH moved the following resolution:

- (12) "That the Commission authorise the Finance Committee to consider and accept tenders for the supply and despatch of a War Cross, Type B, to Gibraltar, without further reference to the Commission.

The resolution was seconded by Colonel Chitty and agreed to.

RECOMMENDATION OF
BATTLE EXPLOIT MEMORIALS COMMITTEE.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said there was one recommendation by the Battle Exploit Memorials Committee.

- (13) Sir George Macdonogh moved:-

"That the Commission approve the following recommendations of the Battle Exploit Memorials Committee :-

<u>Unit.</u>	<u>Site applied for.</u>
24th Division.	Le Verguier. Map Roisel 62.C., N.E.4. 1/10,000. L.34.a.25.60."

The resolution was seconded by Admiral Sir Morgan Singer and agreed to.

STAFF OF THE COMMISSION.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said there were the usual resolutions:

APPOINTMENTS.

(14.A.) "That the Commission hereby approve the appointment of the under-mentioned Officers and of the payment to them out of the funds of the Commission of the approved salaries as from the dates set out against their names.

NAME.	APPOINTMENT.	SALARY.	DATE.	AUTHORITY
Burington. W.T.	Clerk of Works "A" (France).	£300/15/350.	14.11.21.	F.C.Res.15/40 of 1.5.21.
Maj.R.J.Hilson.	Inspector of Cemeteries. (Egypt)	£600 a year (Consolidated)	25.1.22.	F.C.Res.10/51 of 8.2.22.
Orwin.J.B.	Clerk of Works "A" (France).	£300/15/350	6.2.22.	F.C.Res.15/40 of 1.6.21.
Lt.Col.L.M. Newell.	Clerk of Works "A" (France).	£300/15/350	8.2.22.	-do-

PROMOTIONS.

(14.B.) "That the Commission hereby approve the promotions of the under-mentioned officers and of the payment to them out of the funds of the Commission of the approved salaries as from the dates set out against their names.

NAME.	APPOINTMENT.	SALARY.	DATE.	AUTHORITY
McPeak. J.	Asst.Foreman Electrician (France) to Asst.Foreman Electrician.	£250 £250/15/300.	7.2.21.	Res.4/1 of 32nd Meeting I.W.G.C.
Sherwin C.J.	Draughtsman "A" (France) on Probation to Draughtsman "A".	£250 £300/15/350.	16.1.22.	F.C.Res. 15/40 of 1.6.21.
Redman H.J.	Clerk of Works "A" (France) on Probation to Clerk of Works "A"	£250 £300/15/350.	1.2.22.	do.
Burgess.H.T.	Clerk of Works "A" (France) to Chief Clerk of Works.	£300/15/350 £350/15/400	1.2.22.	do.
Rodger.J.	Clerk of Works "B" (France) To Clerk of Works "B".	£200 £250/10/300	1.2.22.	do.

TRANSFER.

(14.C.) "That the Commission hereby approve the transfer of the under-mentioned officer and of the payment to him out of the funds of the Commission of the approved salary, as from the date set out against his name.

NAME.	APPOINTMENT.	SALARY	DATE	AUTHORITY
Capt.F.Shaw.	Chief Clerk of Works (France) to Clerk of Works "A"	£350/15/400 £300/15/350	1.12.21.	F.C.Res.15/40 of 1.6.21."

RESIGNATIONS.

(14.D.) "That the Commission hereby accept the resignations of the under-mentioned officers from the dates set out against their names.

NAME.	APPOINTMENT.	SALARY	DATE
Redpath J.W.	Chief Clerk of Works (France)	£350/15/400	10.1.22.
Engelbach.R.C.	2nd Class Clerk (London)	£300/25/400	31.1.22.
Maj.B.Spencer.	Clerk of Works "A" (France)	£300/15/350	4.2.22.
Perks. C.	Draughtsman "B"(France)	£250	5.2.22.
Capt.C.A.Hull.	Asst.Hort.Officer (France)	£350/15/400	17.1.22."

The resolutions were moved by Sir James Allen, seconded by Colonel Hogben and agreed to.

GRAVES IN AUSTRALIA.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that the High Commissioner for Australia had asked him to bring up the question of the treatment of graves in Australia. It had been suggested that they should make the same arrangement as had been made in the case of New Zealand.

Moved by Mr. Rudyard Kipling:

- (15) "That the Government of Australia, through its representative, having signified that they desire to carry out the general scheme of the Imperial War Graves Commission for the treatment of graves in Australian territory, the Commission welcome the offer of the Australian Government to undertake and supervise the construction and maintenance of cemeteries and the care of the graves in Australia at their own cost."

The resolution was seconded by Sir George Macdonogh and agreed to.

NAVAL MEMORIALS.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said there were difficulties in connection with the best method of inviting tenders for the construction of the Naval Memorials at Plymouth, Portsmouth and Chatham, and the Memorial to the Missing at Ypres, which he thought could only be dealt with by the Finance Committee with the help of Treasury advice.

Moved by Sir George Macdonogh:

- (16) "That it be an instruction to the Finance Committee to consider the best method of inviting tenders for the construction of the Naval Memorials to be erected at Plymouth, Portsmouth and Chatham, and that they be authorised to instruct the officials of the Commission

to act on these recommendations without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Sir James Allen and agreed to.

INSCRIPTION REGARDING GIFT OF LAND, BEERSHEBA.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that Mr. Kipling had drawn up the wording of an inscription to be put up in cemeteries commemorating the gift of land. This inscription read "The land on which this Cemetery stands is the free gift of the people of ----- for the perpetual resting place of those of the Allied Armies who fell in the war 1914-18, and are honoured here." The Palestine Committee had asked them with reference to Beersheba, to insert some words to show that the land had in the first instance been given by the Municipality to the people of Palestine, who had conveyed it to the Commission. He suggested the following modification: "The land on which this Cemetery stands is the free grant of the people of Palestine, to whom it was given by the Municipality of Beersheba for the perpetual resting place of those of the Allied Armies who fell in the war 1914-18, and are honoured here."

The inscription was agreed to.

PERSONAL INSCRIPTIONS.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he had two personal inscriptions he wished to bring to the notice of the Commission. The first was:

"Set out to help save England.
Result: England permanently damned."

The second was :

"He left our home to fight the Hun.
Little did we think he would never return."

He proposed, if the Commission approved, to refuse to allow either of these inscriptions.

The Commission agreed.