

DRAFT.

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS
of the
41st MEETING OF THE IMPERIAL WAR GRAVES COMMISSION
held at
H. M. OFFICE OF WORKS
on
TUESDAY, 17th JANUARY, 1922.

PRESENT:

Major-General Sir FABIAN WARE, K.B.E., C.B., C.M.G.,
in the Chair.

Colonel W. W. CHITTY, C.M.G.,
Representing the Secretary of State for India.

The Hon. Sir GEORGE PERLEY, K.C.M.G.,
High Commissioner for Canada.

M. L. SHEPHERD, Esq., I.S.C.
Representing the High Commissioner for Australia.

Colonel the Hon. Sir JAMES ALLEN, K.C.B.,
High Commissioner for New Zealand.

The Hon. Sir EDGAR WALTON, K.C.M.G.
High Commissioner for South Africa.

Lieut-General Sir GEORGE MACDONOGH, K.C.B., K.C.M.G.

Sir ROBERT HUDSON, G.B.E.

Vice-Admiral Sir MORGAN SINGER, K.C.V.O., C.B.

H. MADDOCKS, Esq., K.C., M.P.

Colonel Lord ARTHUR BROWNE, K.B.E.,

Principal Assistant Secretary.

THERE WERE ALSO PRESENT;

Lieut-Colonel H. ELLISSEN, C.B.E.

Lieut-Colonel F. R. DURHAM, O.B.E., M.C.

Lieut-Colonel C. P. OSWALD, O.B.E.

Major H. F. CHETTLER, O.B.E.

The minutes of the 40th Meeting were considered.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he had received a letter from Lord Crawford, who was unable to attend, in which he suggested that the word "Honorary" in Resolution No. 6 concerning the appointment of Sir Maurice Fitzmaurice as Consulting Engineer be omitted. The Vice Chairman asked whether anybody would move the necessary resolution enabling this alteration to be made. He understood it had been made clear that Sir Maurice Fitzmaurice would charge nothing for any work he did himself, but that if any members of the firm were employed they would be paid their expenses.

It was agreed that the resolution should stand.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that Lord Crawford had also wished to make a verbal alteration in the statement attributed to him in line 3 of page 12 of the draft minutes as circulated. The words "lines of trees" should read "lime trees". This amendment was agreed to.

(1) The minutes as amended were agreed to.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that this was Sir George Perley's last attendance on the Commission. They would at a subsequent meeting wish to express formally their feelings with regard to the work Sir George Perley had done for the Commission, and all that he wished to do at present was to say how deeply they all personally regretted that Sir George Perley would not be attending their meetings in the immediate future. His name would always be remembered as one of the founders of the Commission. He (the Vice Chairman) had always known that he could at any time get the advice and guidance of Sir George Perley when they were in difficulties and his counsel on many occasions had been simply invaluable. On his own behalf and on behalf of the other members there, he would like to express their very deep personal regret and to wish all future happiness both to Lady Perley and himself.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH said he wished to support the Vice Chairman's statement. He had been brought closely into contact with Sir George Perley, both on the Commission and in the War Office, for many years, and he always received from him the maximum of assistance. They all knew how much the country owed to Sir George Perley for the way in which he had built up the Canadian Corps in France and for the assistance which he had so generously given in the war. His departure would be felt very much, not only on the Commission but in the War Office, and wherever else he was known.

SIR GEORGE PERLEY said he much appreciated the remarks that had been made. As far as the Imperial War Graves Commission were concerned, he did not think that he had ever taken a greater interest in any organisation. It was the first attempt at a really Imperial administrative organisation, and it had seemed to him a test as to whether such joint organisations could be managed successfully. He thought they could congratulate themselves that this had been done on the Imperial War Graves Commission. He thought that all present would agree that Sir Fabian Ware had borne the brunt of all the work and that they were fortunate in obtaining a man of his temperament and ability to carry on the work in its initial and most difficult stages. He (Sir George Perley) had originally come over in 1914 intending to stay seven weeks but had stayed seven years. Owing to the war he had obtained a wide experience he could not have had in any other way and he had been thankful for the chance of rendering some little service in the great events that had taken place. He would always follow the deliberations of the Imperial War Graves Commission with a great deal of interest and he wished for them every success in the future in carrying on their work.

REPORT OF THE 49th MEETING OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE.

SIR JAMES ALLEN said he had taken the chair at the 49th Meeting of the Finance Committee. One of the most important points which had been raised was the question of the Double Income Tax. The French were charging Income Tax on the Commission's staff in France. They had a legal right to do so and the question arose as to whether the Commission should pay the tax themselves. The Finance Committee had suggested that this should be done on the understanding that further efforts should be made to come to an arrangement with the French Government. The amount he thought was about £7,000 a year and there were two year's arrears, but they hoped to arrange the matter on a lump sum basis.

Another item of importance was the estimates for the year 1922-23. The Finance Committee thought the estimates had been brought down to a very narrow margin but the Treasury thought they should be reduced by another ten per cent.

He moved the adoption of the Report.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that the Finance Committee had worded their resolution so that it definitely stated that the reduction was suggested by the Treasury. He would read to the Commission a letter received from Sir George Barstow. He thought if the Treasury with their wide experience took the responsibility, after having very carefully gone into the estimates, of suggesting this reduction, they were right in accepting it. An identical explanatory statement would be furnished to each of the Dominion Governments and to the British Government.

After some discussion

SIR ROBERT HUDSON seconded the adoption of the Report, which was (2) agreed to.

MEMORIAL TO MISSING AT THE MENIN GATE.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that at the 34th Meeting they had passed a resolution that the Commission's proposed design should be referred to the Middleton Committee for advice as to whether it would meet the objects for which the Middleton Committee had been constituted. The Middleton Committee had disappeared, and the Advisory Committee which had replaced it had gone carefully into the design and finally referred it to a Sub-Committee to discuss. The Sub-Committee had recommended the acceptance of the design. This meant that the British Government would not erect any national memorial at the same place, feeling that the need would be met by the memorial the Commission were erecting at Ypres. He would ask for formal authority from the Commission to proceed with the acquisition of the site, etc. It was estimated that this memorial would cost less than the basis of £5 per man. The total estimated cost was £177,000 which at £5 would allow for 35,400 names, but provision had been made on the memorial to include 50,000.

SIR JAMES ALLEN said he wished to make it clear that the resolution did not commit New Zealand to the scheme.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that what the British Government had desired in the matter was that the Dominions should feel that it was open to them to join voluntarily in these memorials to the "missing" and that there was room for their names on the Ypres Memorial if they wished. New Zealand had decided not to join in and were getting ahead with their proposals for memorials to the "missing" in the cemeteries; he could assure Sir James Allen that the proposed resolution would not in any way commit New Zealand or any other Dominion.

SIR JAMES ALLEN said that in that case he was satisfied.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH moved the following resolution:-

- (3) (a) That the acquisition of the site of the proposed memorial to the "missing" at Ypres and of the obtaining of all necessary permits to build be proceeded with forthwith.
- (b) That estimates of the cost of all preliminary work necessary for the preparation of tenders for the construction of the proposed memorial to the "missing" at Ypres be laid before the Finance Committee and that the Finance Committee be empowered to consider and approve the said estimates and authorise the necessary expenditure without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Sir Robert Hudson and agreed to.

ENEMY GRAVES IN THE UNITED KINGDOM.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said the amount of money involved was small, but an interesting question of principle was raised. They had received a Supplementary Charter which gave powers to the Commission to act on behalf of any Government of the Empire for the purpose of fulfilling the obligation under the Peace Treaty of caring for enemy graves in any part of the Empire. They were now taking over the care of enemy graves in the United Kingdom, and from the paper before them it would be seen that the majority were in the United Kingdom. The Treasury had raised the question as to whether the cost of treating these should be borne as a general charge upon the funds of the Commission or whether it should be a liability of the British Government only. He would point out that prisoners taken by British or Dominion troops were for convenience generally sent to Great Britain; hence these graves in the United Kingdom.

SIR GEORGE PERLEY thought it was a curious position that they should relieve the Germans from their obligation to maintain British graves in Germany, while at the same time paying for the maintenance of German graves in this country.

MR. MADDOCKS pointed out that it was open to the British Government to insist on the Germans carrying out their obligations as regards British graves but they preferred to do it themselves.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN thought there was no doubt the Germans would do so if desired.

SIR GEORGE PERLEY thought that if the Commission were going to maintain British graves in Germany and also German graves in the United Kingdom, the German Government should pay the Commission so much a year to cover the difference between the number of British graves in Germany and the number of German graves in British territory.

SIR ROBERT HUDSON thought there was no need to pass a resolution on the subject at the moment if it was intended to raise the question further with the Germans.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he wished to know whether the Dominion Governments were prepared to join in with the British Government in this matter.

SIR GEORGE PERLEY said that he was against ultimately relieving the Germans of any obligation but he agreed to the work being done at the cost of the Imperial War Graves Commission.

SIR JAMES ALLEN said that New Zealand had no enemy graves, but in spite of that he was prepared to say that he thought New Zealand would join in with the other Dominions and the mother country in taking its share in the cost of maintaining enemy graves in Great Britain or the Dominions, but he agreed with Sir George Perley in thinking that they should not pay on both sides.

After some further discussion Sir Morgan Singer moved the following resolution:-

(4) "That the Commission are of opinion that, pending further

negotiations with the Enemy Governments concerned, the cost of carrying out the obligations under the Peace Treaty of caring for enemy graves in any part of the Empire be a charge upon the funds of the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Colonel Chitty and agreed to.

MEMORIAL TO EGYPTIAN LABOUR CORPS AND CAMEL TRANSPORT CORPS.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that the Egyptian Committee had made suggestions about a memorial to the Egyptian Labour Corps and Camel Transport Corps which the Commission had been unable to accept. They had now made further suggestions: (1) That two free elementary schools should be constructed, one at Port Said and the other at Suez, (2) That the sum of £10,000 should be contributed by the Imperial War Graves Commission for the purposes: (a) of completing a new Ophthalmic Hospital at Giza, near Cairo, estimated to cost £10,000 of which £6,600 had already been collected in subscriptions, etc., say Commission's contribution £3,400, (b) of erecting, on the ample spare land of the site of the above new hospital, a distinctive and separate "Egyptian Labour Corps and Camel Transport Corps Memorial Laboratory" estimated to cost £6,600. The Egyptian Government had expressed a preference for the adoption of No.2. proposal, but the Treasury Solicitor had advised that they had no power under the Charter to agree to (2a). He suggested therefore that they should approve the proposal under (2b) which would not debar the Egyptian Committee from coming back and suggesting further expenditure to make up the £10,000. The Egyptian Government did not contribute towards the expenses of the War Graves Commission and the number of casualties among the Labour Corps, which were estimated at approximately 50,000, were not included in the

figures on which the proportions of contributions were calculated.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH moved the following resolution :-

- (5) "That the Commission, having considered the alternative proposals of the Anglo-Egyptian War Cemeteries Executive Committee and the wishes of the Council of Ministers, approve the suggestion to erect an Egyptian Labour Corps and Camel Transport Corps Memorial Laboratory and authorise the Finance Committee to consider and accept tenders for the same at a cost of not exceeding £6,600 Egyptian without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Sir James Allen and agreed to.

GRAVES IN EAST AFRICA.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said this was a very difficult question owing to the enormous area involved, the absence of communications and the sparse European population. There were some 3,519 graves to be maintained, contained in 295 different places. Many of the routes were no longer maintained and had probably reverted to jungle. The distances were so great that it would not be possible to report on or visit all the graves within a reasonable time. What they proposed, therefore, was to carry out the work of constructing the larger cemeteries and to reserve plots therein for subsequent concentration, and that the scattered graves should, as opportunity offered, be concentrated into convenient centres with the assistance of District Civil Officials.

SIR EDGAR WALTON moved the following resolution :-

- (6) "(a) That the Commission approve the proposal to concentrate graves throughout Kenya Colony, Tanganyikaland, Uganda, Nyassaland and Rhodesia into convenient centres; and that the local Governments concerned be asked to co-operate by allowing District Civil Officials to carry out the concentration at the cost of the Commission.

- (b) That the Commission, in view of the difficulties in collecting scattered graves in such centres, approve the proposal to erect commemorative memorials in the larger cemeteries recording the names of those whose graves cannot be accepted as maintainable.
- (c) That the Finance Committee be authorised to grant the necessary funds for the carrying out of the above proposals without further reference to the Commission.
- (d) That the Finance Committee be authorised to consider and sanction the appointment of a special staff to deal with the graves in Portuguese East Africa."

The resolution was seconded by Mr.Maddocks and agreed to.

MARKING OF POINTS OF INTEREST
ON GALLIPOLI PENINSULA.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said this was a request by the Commonwealth Government to assist them in a scheme for marking points of interest. It would be necessary to get the formal authority of the Commission before their staff could carry out the desire of the Australian Government.

SIR JAMES ALLEN said in reply to a question from the Vice Chairman he thought that New Zealand would be interested to know what points were going to be marked.

MR.SHEPHERD moved the following resolution :-

- (7) "That in accordance with the request of the Commonwealth Government the Commission authorise their Director of Works to design and carry out a scheme for the marking of points of interest on the Gallipoli Peninsula, the cost to be recovered from the Commonwealth Government."

The resolution was seconded by Sir Morgan Singer and agreed to.

PERSONAL INSCRIPTIONS ON HEADSTONES IN CANADA.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that a paper had been circulated informing the Commission that the Canadian Government had decided to meet the cost of the personal inscriptions on headstones erected in Canada.

STAFF OF THE COMMISSION.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said there were the usual resolutions :-

APPOINTMENTS.

(8.A.) "That the Commission hereby approve the appointment of the under-mentioned officers and of the payment to them out of the funds of the Commission of the approved salaries as from the dates set out against their names.

| NAME. | APPOINTMENT. | SALARY. | DATE. | AUTHORITY. |
|------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|-----------|--------------------------------|
| Duggan. A.C. | Draughtsman "A" (France) | £300/15/350 | 8.12.21. | F.C.Res.15/40 of 1.6.21. |
| Redman. H.J. | Clerk of Works "A" (France) | £250 (on probation) | 24.10.21. | do. |
| Thomas. E.F. | Clerk of Works "A" (France) | £300/15/350 | 1. 1.22. | F.C.Res.9/24 of 14.7.21. |
| Brown. R.I. | Clerk of Works "B" | £250/15/300 | 8. 1.22. | do. |
| Cunningham G. Capt. | Asst. D.D.of W. (London) | £700/25/800 | 9. 1.22. | F.C.Res.14/48 of 14.12.21." |

PROMOTIONS.

(S.B.) "That the Commission hereby approve the promotion of the under-mentioned officer and of the payment to him out of the funds of the Commission of the approved salary as from the date set out against his name.

| NAME. | APPOINTMENT. | SALARY. | DATE. | AUTHORITY. |
|-------------|--|----------------------------|-----------|----------------------------|
| Flinn. H.E. | Draughtsman "B" (France) To Clk/Wks. "B". | £200/15/250 £250/15/300 | 20.12.21. | F.C.Res.15. of 1.6.21." |

TRANSFER.

(S.C.) "That the Commission hereby approve the transfer of the undermentioned officer and of the payment to him out of the funds of the Commission of the approved salary as from the date set out against his name.

| NAME. | APPOINTMENT. | SALARY. | DATE. | AUTHORITY. |
|----------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|----------|-------------------------------|
| Capt.C.A.Hull. | Hort.Officer to Asst.Hort.Officer. | £450/20/600 £350/15/400 | 20.6.21. | F.C.Res.14/43 of 14.9.21." |

RESIGNATIONS.

(S.D.) "That the Commission hereby accept the resignations of the undermentioned officers from the dates set out against their names.

| NAME. | APPOINTMENT. | SALARY. | DATE. |
|-------------|--------------------------|-------------|------------|
| Goode. A.W. | Draughtsman "A" (France. | £300/15/350 | 10.12.21. |
| Fox. S.J. | Mechanic (Italy) | £275/10/300 | 31.8.21. |
| Jack. A.D. | Motor Driver Mechanic | £260/10/300 | 13.12.21." |

The resolutions were moved by Mr. Maddocks, seconded by Sir Edgar Walton and agreed to.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he had a personal inscription which he had promised to submit to the Commission. The next-of-kin originally wished to engrave "His loving parents curse the Hun." They had been written to on the subject, but the only result was that they sent back the following modification :-

"With every breath we draw
 We curse the German more;
 May the French and British paw
 Keep the devils in their place
 For evermore."

He proposed to decline to engrave the inscription.

The Commission agreed.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said there was another point he wished to mention to the Commission and that was connected with a private memorial erected in Calais Southern Cemetery by a Mr. Wanklyn. The memorial which had been erected before the General Routine Order forbidding this had by a mistake been removed without consulting the next-of-kin, when the mistake was discovered he immediately gave instructions that the memorial was to be put back again on the grave, but meanwhile the father had visited the

cemetery and found the memorial removed and had given a great deal of trouble in the matter. He (the Vice Chairman) had gone personally to his house in Hampstead to discuss the matter with him but he insisted on receiving a written undertaking that the memorial would be allowed to remain.

He proposed to inform Mr. Wanklyn that he had discussed the matter with the Commission and no guarantee could be given that the memorial would be allowed to remain.

MR. MADDOCKS said that he had recently visited the cemeteries and had been struck by the necessity of coming to a definite decision on the question of these private memorials. Any decision they made with regard to the Wanklyn case would be applicable to all the cemeteries. No exception could be made.

After further discussion the Commission agreed to the Vice Chairman writing to Mr. Wanklyn as suggested.

FREE DISTRIBUTION OF CEMETERY REGISTERS.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN wished to ask if the Dominion representatives would let the Office know the number of registers which they wished to get as a free issue. He would be glad if this could be cut down to an absolute minimum. There were to be some 1500 of these registers and the expense would be great.

The High Commissioners present agreed they would require no copies for their offices in London and thought one for each Dominion would suffice.

HERCHIES COMMUNAL CEMETERY.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that in this cemetery there were eight graves in a small separate plot and the Communal Authorities had erected a memorial of Belgian granite. In order to treat the plot in harmony with the monument, a design had been drawn up differing slightly from the usual method adopted

by the Commission and which involved an excess of about a £1 per grave over the usual tender.

SIR GEORGE MACDONOGH moved :-

- (9) "That the Commission approve the special design No.808/3 for the treatment of Herchies Communal Cemetery and hereby authorise the Finance Committee to consider and accept tenders for the same without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Sir George Perley and agreed to.

AMENDMENTS TO FORM OF STANDARD CONTRACT.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said he wished authority to consider some amendments to the form of standard contracts for construction.

SIR EDGAR WALTON moved :-

- (10) "That the Finance Committee be authorised to consider and decide on certain recommended alterations in the standard form of contract for construction without further reference to the Commission."

The resolution was seconded by Sir James Allen and agreed to.

DELVILLE WOOD.

SIR EDGAR WALTON said he wished to raise a question with regard to the fencing at Delville Wood. He had been quoted very high prices although they only wanted the roughest kind of fence to keep cattle and trespassers out. He wished to know if the Commission had not some staff who could carry this out for them if the material were supplied.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN said that the Commission would be very willing to assist with advice and superintendence but they had no staff to do work of the kind as almost all their constructions, etc. was done through contractors.